

An Annotated Bibliography

**Of surveys and studies that demonstrate
the impact of positive and negative
human rights practices in the workplace.**

March 2003

Funding support provided by the Human Rights, Citizenship and
Multiculturalism Education Fund

**Prepared by:
Jennifer Adkins, Diversity Research Analyst
Adkins Consulting Group**

This annotated bibliography builds on the previous one provided in Appendix A and C of the *Employers' Perspectives Research Report* (2002), written by Howard Research and Instructional Systems Inc. The articles' publication dates used in this updated bibliography range between 1996 and 2003 and utilize both qualitative and quantitative data. All of the studies, with the exception of six, include primarily Canadian data. Two separate comparative studies, examine similarities between Canada and Australia in 1999, and Canada, the United States, South Korea, and Kenya in 2002, in the area of workplace equity.

Issues surrounding discrimination under the grounds of gender, race, physical disability, age, sexual orientation, family status, and marital status are explored and briefly summarized. Two distinct studies research the discriminatory treatment of women and homosexual employees in unions. Readers will also find references directing them to articles highlighting the success story of IBM and the tragic account of Walmart's multimillion-dollar discrimination lawsuits.

Resources found in "Other References" include books, magazines articles, and websites that address diversity, Employment Equity, discrimination and Human Rights. These are predominantly informative or anecdotal resources, although some less current studies can be found in this section.

- Adams, Scott J. (2002). "Passed Over for Promotion Because of Age: An Empirical Analysis of the Consequences." *Journal of Labor Research* 23:3:447-461.
- Although older workers experience higher wages and lower unemployment rates, there is increase in number of cases filed with Equal Employment Opportunities Commission (EEOC).
 - American study utilizes the Health and Retirement study to determine whether preferences for younger workers harm older workers.
 - Samples of individuals in their fifties.
 - Findings show that as promotion practices (based on age) increase, wages decrease, and as promotions practices (based on age) increase, the decision to retire also increases.
 - Data also demonstrates that there is a possibility that some individuals experience undue harm when discriminated against in promotions.

Agocs, Carol and Jain Harish (2000). *Systemic Racism in Canada: Diagnosing Systemic Racism in Organizational Culture*. A Report Prepared for the Canadian Race Relations Foundation. Retrieved from the World Wide Web:
<http://www.crr.ca/EN/Publications/ePubHome.htm#Research%20Reports%20and%20Tools>.

PDF File found under "Research Reports and Tools".

- Canadian study examines systemic discrimination in the workplace, using qualitative and quantitative data.
- 25 Focus group interviews with at least 6 groups from Aboriginal, Black, Asian, and South Asian backgrounds; at least 3 groups of each population exclusively women and exclusively men.
- Authors also analyze 119 legal cases related to employment race discrimination, published in the Canadian Human Rights Reporter, between 1980-1998.
- Evident that presence of racism in Canadian workforce.
- Assessment tool developed to identify racial discrimination alone or combined with sexism, to aid in employment equity at work.

Canadian Council on Social Development (2000). *Unequal Access: A Canadian Profile of Racial Differences in Education, Employment and Income*. A Report Prepared for the Canadian Race Relations Foundation. Retrieved from the World Wide Web:

<http://www.crr.ca/EN/Publications/ePubHome.htm#Research%20Reports%20and%20Tools>.

PDF File found under "Research Reports and Tools".

- Report highlights discrepancies in education, employment, and income
- Claims to be the first report documenting the socio-economic profile of racial groups in Canada combining quantitative (mainly 1996 Census) and qualitative data.
- Using random sample, 7 focus groups conducted in Halifax, Winnipeg, Vancouver, Montreal, and Toronto.
- Findings show that "racial minorities" have difficulties finding jobs that match their qualifications (they are usually overqualified) and getting promotions.
- Foreign credentials are not recognized.

- Visible minorities have equal or better educational attainment than “non-racialized” groups, yet experience significantly lower rates of employment and annual earnings.

Chenevert, Denis and Michel Tremblay (2002). “Managerial Career Success in Canadian Organizations: Is Gender a Determinant?”. *International Journal of Human Resource Management* 13:6 920-941.

- Research to determine whether 5 theoretical explanations/approaches of managerial success can eliminate the influence of gender on the position.
- Five theoretical explanations include human capital, family context, socio-economic origin, work investment and reward expectations, and structural factors.
- Research sample includes 2,562 male managers and 498 female managers in 3 sectors of Canadian economy.
- Questionnaires used to obtain data with the response rates between 23% and 42%.
- Two equal sub-samples taken from the larger sample, formed on the basis of seniority in organization and creating more homogeneity in sample; 282 men and 282 women.
- Despite homogenous sample, numerous controlled variables, and related theoretical approaches, findings did not allow researchers to eliminate the possibility of discrimination in Canadian enterprises.
- Theoretical explanations could not eliminate the influence of gender on managerial success.
- Authors caution that women are more likely than men to change employees when treated inequitably, causing the loss of competent managers and affecting the performance of the organization.

Firestone, Juanita M. and Richard J. Harris (2003). “Perceptions of Effectiveness of Responses to Sexual Harassment in the U.S. Military, 1988 and 1995”. *Gender, Work, and Organisation* 10:1:42-64.

- American study comparing the responses on “1988 Department of Defense Survey of Sex Roles in the Active –Duty Military” and “1995 Armed Forces Sexual Harassment Survey”.
- Authors analyse perception of how effective the measures are to stop sexual harassment.
- Findings reveal that a high percentage of people experience “uninvited” and “unwanted” advances, although the military has been able to lower actual incidents of sexual harassment.
- Notes made from Abstract.

Franzway, Suzanne (1999). “‘They See You Coming’. A Comparative Study of Sexual Politics and Women Union Officials in (English) Canada and Australia”. *Labour and Industry* 10:2: 147-168.

- Comparative study of women unionists in Canada and Australia.
- Examination of gender relations in trade union movements in each country.
- Snowball sampling and semi-structured interviews administered to women unionists.

- Findings show that male issues are only issues on union agenda, excluding views and needs of women and homosexuals.
- Sexual harassment underestimated and overlooked.
- Trade union movements contribute to continuing gender inequalities.

Gilbert, Jacqueline A. and Deniz S. Ones (1998). "Role of Informal Integration in Career Advancement: Investigations in Plural and Multicultural Organizations and Implications for Diversity Valuation". *Sex Roles* 39:9/10:685-704.

- American comparative study examines informal social integration of employees in 2 organizations, in different stages of valuing their diversity.
- 2 Studies conducted on 2 organizational data sets; one considered "plural", the other, "multicultural".
- Both companies are local branches of multinational Fortune 100 conglomerates with 750-1000 employees.
- Questionnaires and interviews used to obtain data.
- Findings indicate that the multicultural organization, where diversity is firmly entrenched in the fabric of company, have greater social integration occurring.

Griffen Cohen, Majorie and Kate Braid (2000). "Training and Equity Initiatives on the British Columbia Vancouver Island Highway Project: A Model for Large-Scale Construction Projects". *Labor Studies Journal* 25:3:70-103.

- Study analyzes the project agreement and procedures taken to integrate women and First Nations people in a seven-year commercial highway project.
- Equity initiatives for the Vancouver Island Highway Project is the first time that equity measures are requirement in project agreement in Canada.
- Detailed biweekly labour force statistics are collected by employer (HCL) to give an overview on equity workers involvement in project.
- 38 Extensive interviews conducted with workers, contractors, trainers, trade union representatives, and government personnel.
- "Our assessment is that the [Victoria Island Highway Project] is an excellent model to use as a generic approach for training and integrating people from traditionally excluded groups into the workforce of large-scale construction projects (74)."
- Number of women and First Nations people was a great deal higher than is normally the case for building construction projects.
- Each year the number of hours worked by equity groups increased.
- Authors provide reasons as to why this initiative was so successful.
- Case study is unique as the nature of the industry lends itself to "workers who face a succession of hiring barriers not typical in other discriminatory workplaces (71)".

Hammonds, Keith H. (2000). "Difference Is Power". *Fast Company* 36:258. July Edition from the World Wide Web:
<http://www.fastcompany.com>

- Interview with Ted Childs, IBM's Vice President of Global Workforce Diversity.
- Article about IBM's success at promoting diversity.

- Illustrates the change in their approach, which leads to a change in the corporation's environment.
- A larger and diverse talent pool is evident.
- Brief history of IBM's appreciation for the power of diversity dating back to 1924.

Hum, Derek and Wayne Simpson (1996). "Canadians with Disabilities and the Labour Market". *Canadian Public Policy* 22:3:285-299.

- Canadian study with data obtained from 1989 Labour Market Activity Survey to determine effects of disabilities on people between the ages 15 and 64 in the labour market.
- Data shows no evidence of earnings discrimination against employed men and women with disabilities.
- Notes made from abstract.

Hunt, Gerald (1997). "Sexual Orientation and the Canadian Labour Movement". *Relations Industrielles* 52:4:787-809.

- Cross Canada study of labour's involvement with discrimination on basis of sexual orientation.
- Many methods used to collect data including: data collection from union federation, union headquarters and collective agreements; interviewing officials; telephone surveys with senior officials; and detailed case studies with workers.
- All provinces invited to participate although P.E.I., Saskatchewan, Alberta, Yukon, and the North West Territories refuse to participate.
- "...Canadian based labour organizations, in the public sector, especially those with a strong activist presence, higher average female membership, supportive leadership, and women's committees, are most likely to have made significant progress on the issue, even though one factor may be more pivotal in a given setting. CUPE leads the pack on the prototype union..." (807).

Konrad, Alison M. and Kathy Cannings (1997). "The Effects of Gender Role Congruence and Statistical Discrimination on Managerial Advancement". *Human Relations* 50:10:1305-1328.

- Researchers to determine if managerial advancement different in process for men and women.
- Study involving data from 2 publicly held corporations, both competing internationally and directly competitive in some markets.
- One company is Canadian and the other is American.
- Questionnaires distributed to middle-level managers randomly chosen in each company.
- American company has 686 responding out of 1000 (68.6% response rate), while Canadian company had 672 out of 800 (84.0% response rate).
- Findings show that men are rewarded for their efforts in paid work and penalized for their efforts toward unpaid home and family work; years of service affects Canadian men more strongly than Canadian women.

- Also shown that men have more years of service than women and women have better performance appraisals than men; women and men in the U.S. company are both likely to hold graduate degrees, while Canadian women are more likely to have a graduate degree compared to Canadian men.

Mudrick, Nancy R. and Adrienne Asch (1996). "Investigation and Enforcement of a Disability Discrimination Statute: Complaints of Employment Discrimination Filed in New York State". *Journal of Disability Policy and Studies* 7:2:21-41.

- Authors investigate 7,189 complaints of employment discrimination, for 10 year period of 1984-1994.
- Findings reveal that almost half of complainants had college degree or more education'84% of complaints filed by people with jobs or those recently employed.
- Most complained of unjust promotions, demotions, reclassifications, terminations, and wage discrimination.

Mueller W., Charles and Tor Wynn (2000). "The Degree to Which Justice Is Valued in the Workplace". *Social Justice Research* 13:1:1-24.

- Study to provide descriptive baseline data to determine to what degree people value justice in the workplace relating to workplace conditions and rewards.
- Examines whether the importance of justice varies by gender, race, income, age, and organizational tenure.
- Cross-national and cross-study project examining 17,713 cases in the U.S./Canada, South Korea, and Kenya.
- Findings reveal that justice in workplace is valued in all 3 cultures; variance is small.
- Justice in the workplace does not, or only weakly covaries with race, income, age, and tenure but women value this form of justice more than men.

Ornstein, Michael and Penni Stewart (1996). "Gender and Faculty Pay in Canada". *Canadian Journal of Sociology* 21:4:461-481.

- Case study of pay of fulltime university faculty in Canada.
- Statistical analysis of 1986 survey of Canadian Faculty.
- Data provides much broader variables affecting pay than Statistics Canada.
- Surveys mailed out to stratified random sample of 10,211 fulltime faculty at major Canadian universities and 5,217 completed (51%).
- Analysis shows that female faculty earn an average of \$8,500 less than male faculty, until numerous variables are controlled for; then, gender income gap became \$3,070 per year.
- Researchers expect that as more women go into academia and their qualifications become more similar, the wage gap will no longer exist.

Perrot, Stephen B. (1999). "Visible Minority Applicant Concerns and Assessment of Occupational Role in the Era of Community-based Policing". *Journal of Community & Applied Social Psychology* 9:5:339-353.

- Exploratory and Community-based descriptive research involving African-Canadian police applicants' views.



- 80 Applicants to a Canadian municipal police department fill out questionnaires (88% response rate).
- Results show that “*applicants viewed racial prejudice and discrimination, both from police departments and society at large, as the most significant obstacles to minority recruitment.*”

Ranson, Gillian and William Joseph Reeves (1996). “Gender, Earnings, and Promotions of Women: Lessons from a High-Tech Occupation”. *Gender and Society* 10:2:168-184.

- Authors examine 14 organizations in Western Canadian city.
- Sample of 451 computer professionals
- Data shows women do not do as well in areas of income and job status, usually attributable to work experience.
- Authors point out strategies that act at limiting women’s access into positions of authority.
- Notes taken from abstract.

Salter, Chuck (2003). “The Next Big (Legal) Thing”. *Fast Company* p.112. April ABI Inform Global Search.

- United States largest private employer (Walmart) being charged in discrimination lawsuit.
- Walmart has faced more lawsuits than any other company in U.S. (about 5,000 in year 2,000).
- Allegations that women systemically discriminated against.
- Class action, including 700,000 current and former employees, would be largest employment discrimination case ever filed.

Stelcner, Morton (2000). “Earnings Differentials among Ethnic Groups in Canada: A Review of the Research”. *Review of Social Economy* 58:3:295-317.

- Literature review of Canadian research findings on ethnic earnings differences.
- Claims that small sample sizes hinder Canadian research on topic.
- Demonstrates that it creates a problem with data when “whites” and “visible minorities” are combined as two heterogeneous groups.
- Some white groups are disadvantaged and others are favoured in terms of earnings.
- Earnings of visible minorities show great discrepancies and when gender is considered, there is more variation.
- Aboriginal men earned 85% less than the national average for men.

Tougas, Francine, Rupert Brown, Ann M. Beaton, and Line St. Pierre (1999). “Neosexism Among Women: The Role of Personally Experienced Social Mobility Attempts”. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin* 25:12:1487-1497.

- Sample consists of 335 secretaries of a Canadian federal agency.
- Authors argue that women attempting to enter non-traditional areas of work experience more discrimination.
- Notes taken from abstract.

Other References

- Agocs, Carol, Reem Attieh, and Martin Cooke (2000). "Equity Practitioners in Canadian Universities: A Study of Organizational Change Agents' Roles". Association Paper for the *Society for the Study of Social Problems*.
- Bailyn, L. (2003). "Academic Careers and Gender Equity: Lessons Learned from MIT". *Gender, Work & Organization* 10:2:137-153.
- Buchanan, Anne and Mary O'Neil (2001). *Inclusion and Diversity: Finding common Ground for Organizational Action*. A Guide prepared for the Canadian Council for International Co-operation.
- Cadrain, Diane (2003). "Equality's Final Frontier". *HR Magazine*. March Edition from the World Wide Web:
<http://www.shrm.org/hrmagazine/>
- Ganz, Jeffrey (1999). "Aboriginal Economic Development". *Ivey Business Journal* 64:1:30.
- Graham, Lawrence Otis (1997). *Proversity*. New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Graves M. Laura and Gary N. Powell (1994). "Effects of Sex-Based Preferential Selection and Discrimination on Job Attitudes". *Human Relations* 47:2:1994.
- Hayes, Victor (1999). "Beyond Employment Equity". *Ivey Business Journal* 64:1:44.
- Henry, Frances, Carol Tator, Winston Mattis, and Tim Reeves (1995). *The Colour of Democracy: Racism in Canadian Society*. Toronto: Harcourt Brace and Company Canada, Ltd.
- Institute of Management and Administration (2003). "HR's Next Recruiting Challenge: No Diversity Plan; No Workers (Strategic Planning)". *Human Resources Department of Management Report*. Search on Calgary Public Library Database: Business and Company Resource Center.
- John Samuel & Associates (1997). *Visible Minorities and the Public Service of Canada*. A Report submitted to the Canadian Human Rights Commission.
- Kallen, Evelyn (1995). *Ethnicity and Human Rights in Canada* 2nd edition. Toronto: Oxford University Press.
- Kennedy, Edward. (1999). "The North West Company". *Ivey Business Journal* 64:1:12.
- Kirby, Erika L. and Lynn M. Harter (2003). "Speaking the Language of the Bottom-Line: the Metaphor of 'Managing Diversity'". *The Journal of Business Communication* 40:1:28-49.

- Kirkpatrick, Laura (2001). "Multicultural Strategies for Community Colleges: Expanding Faculty Diversity". *EricDigest*. Obtained from World Wide Web: <http://askeric.org/plweb-cgi/obtain.pl>. or <http://www.gseis.ucla.edu/ERIC/eric.html>
- Leck, Joanne D. and David M. Saunders (1992). "Hiring Women: The Effects of Canada's *Employment Equity Act*". *Canadian Public Policy* 17:2:203-220.
- Leck, Joanne D., Sylvie St. Onge, and Isabelle Lalancette (1995). "Wage Gap Changes Among Organizations Subject to the *Employment Equity Act*". *Canadian Public Policy* 21:4:387-400.
- Mayo, Margarita (1999). "Capitalizing on a Diverse Workforce". *Ivey Business Journal* 64:1:20.
- Mock, Karen R. and April Shor Laufer ((2001). *Race Relation Training in Canada: Towards Development of Professional Standards*. A Report Prepared for the Canadian Race Relations Foundation. Retrieved from the World Wide Web: <http://www.crr.ca/EN/Publications/ePubHome.htm#Research%20Reports%20and%20Tools>.
- Riach, P.A. and J. Rich (2002). "Field Experiments of Discrimination in the Market Place". *Economic Journal* 112:483:480-518.
- Salter, Chuck (2002). "Diversity Without the Excuses". *Fast Company* 62:44. September Edition from the World Wide Web: <http://www.fastcompany.com>
- Stutz, Johnathan and Randy Massengale (1997). "Measuring Diversity Initiatives". *HR Magazine*. December Edition from the World Wide Web: <http://www.shrm.org/hrmagazine/>
- Thacker, Rebecca A. (1992). "A Descriptive Study of Behavioral Responses of Sexual Harassment Targets: Implications for Control Theory". *Employee Responsibilities and Rights Journal* 5:2:155-171.
- Thomas, R. Roosevelt Jr. (1991). *Beyond Race and Gender: Unleashing the Power of Your Total Work Force by Managing Diversity*. New York: Amacom.
- Thomas, R. Roosevelt Jr. (1996). *Redefining Diversity*. New York: Amacom.
- Welsh, Sandy, Myrna Dawson, and Annette Nierobisz (1999). "Do Extra-Legal Attributes Matter? Sexual Harassment Complaint Outcomes and the Canadian Human Rights Commission". Association Paper for the *American Sociological Association*.
- Zachary, G. Pascal (2000). "Mighty is the Mongrel". *Fast Company* 36:270. July Edition from the World Wide Web: <http://www.fastcompany.com>

Search Procedure

Search Terms:

Diversity
Managing Diversity
Workplace Diversity
Diversity in the Workplace
Diversity at work

Harassment
Sexual Harassment
Harassment Training
Human Rights

Best Practices
Bench Marking

Age
Disability
Gender
Discrimination
Racism

Affirmative Action
Employment Equity
Equity in Employment

Canada
Employment

The preceding words were combined differently depending on the database or search engine being used.

Search Engine:

www.google.com

Websites of Interest:

www.crr.ca/rt/ (Canadian Race Relations)
www.diversity@work.com
www.diversityinc.com
www.fastcompany.com (Fast Company Magazine)
www.fortune.com (Fortune Magazine)
www.geocities.com
www.magportal.com
www.nextstepmag.com (Next Step Magazine)
www.shrm.org

Electronic Resources/Databases:

ABI inform Global
Business Index ASAP
CBCA (full text) Canadian Business Current Affairs
Expanded Academic ASAP
PAIS international – Public Affairs Information Service
Social Sciences Abstracts (Wilson)
Sociological Abstracts
Sociological Collection